



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/567,509	02/07/2006	Phillipe Noelle	H0005922	8537

93136 7590 01/06/2011  
HONEYWELL/PANGRL  
Patent Services  
101 Columbia Road  
Morristown, NJ 07962-2245

EXAMINER
----------

BAYOU, AMENE SETEGNE

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
----------	--------------

3746

NOTIFICATION DATE	DELIVERY MODE
-------------------	---------------

01/06/2011

ELECTRONIC

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Notice of the Office communication was sent electronically on above-indicated "Notification Date" to the following e-mail address(es):

patentservices-us@honeywell.com  
brian@ppbdlaw.com  
chris.james@honeywell.com

<b>Office Action Summary</b>	<b>Application No.</b> 10/567,509	<b>Applicant(s)</b> NOELLE, PHILLIPE	
	<b>Examiner</b> AMENE S. BAYOU	<b>Art Unit</b> 3746	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

#### Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

#### Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 15 October 2010.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**.                      2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

#### Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-3,5-13,15-21,23-25,27-42,45 and 46 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☒ Claim(s) 1-3,5-13,15-19,23-25,27-30,32-42 and 45 is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 46 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☒ Claim(s) 20,21 and 31 is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

#### Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☒ The drawing(s) filed on 07 February 2006 is/are: a) ☒ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

#### Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☒ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All    b) ☐ Some \* c) ☒ None of:
1. ☒ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

#### Attachment(s)

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)                    | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)           |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____                                      |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)         | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____   | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____                          |

## **DETAILED ACTION**

### ***Continued Examination Under 37 CFR 1.114***

1. A request for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, including the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e), was filed in this application after final rejection. Since this application is eligible for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, and the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e) has been timely paid, the finality of the previous Office action has been withdrawn pursuant to 37 CFR 1.114. Applicant's submission filed on 11/09/10 has been entered.

### ***Claim Objections***

2. Claims 20, 21 are objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c) as being in improper form because a multiple dependent claim can not depend on another multiple dependent claim. Claim 31 is also objected since the limitation "according to any of the claims 23 to 25 and 27 to 29" is not in a proper multiple dependent claim format. See MPEP § 608.01(n). Accordingly, the claims have not been further treated on the merits.

### ***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112***

3. The following is a quotation of the **fourth paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112**:

a claim in dependent form shall contain a reference to a claim previously set forth and then specify a further limitation of the subject matter claimed. A claim in dependent form shall be construed to incorporate by reference all the limitations of the claim to which it refers.

4. Claim 46 is rejected under 35 USC 112 4th paragraph, as being an improper dependent claim for failing to include all the limitations of the claim upon which it depends and for failing to further limit the subject matter of the claim upon which it

Art Unit: 3746

depends. Specifically, claim 46 is directed to a turbocharger since it recites “Turbocharger comprising a compressor housing, a center housing and an electric motor according to claim 1” while claim 1 from which claim 46 is directed to an electric motor. Therefore claim 46 fails to further limit the subject matter of claim 1. Applicant should either cancel claim 46 or consider amending claim 46 so that it is in proper dependent form, or rewrite the claim in independent form. As the Federal Circuit treats non-compliance with 35 USC 112 4th paragraph as a patentability issue, it is considered more appropriate to treat a claim that does not comply with 35 USC 112 4th paragraph by rejecting the claim under 35 USC 112 4th rather than by objecting to such claim under 37 CFR 1.75(c) as provided for in MPEP 608.01(n)(II). See *Pfizer Inc. v. Ranbaxy Labs., Ltd.*, 457 F.3d 1284, 1291-92 (Fed. Cir. 2006)

### ***Allowable Subject Matter***

5. Claims 1-3,5-13,15-19,23-25,27-30,32-42,45 are allowed.
6. Claims 20,21,31 and 46 would be allowable if rewritten to overcome the rejection(s) under 35 U.S.C. 112 4<sup>th</sup> paragraph (while overcoming any objection) as set forth in this Office action and to include all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

### ***Response to Arguments***

7. Applicant's arguments with respect to claims 1-46 which was filed on October 15,2010 have been considered but are moot in view of the allowability of the claims necessitated by amendment.

***Conclusion***

8. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Amene S. Bayou whose telephone number is 571-270-3214. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Thursday, 8:00 am-5:00 pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Devon Kramer can be reached on 571-272-7118. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300. Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Devon C Kramer/  
Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art  
Unit 3746

/Amene S Bayou/

Examiner, Art Unit 3746